

Can Al Make Us Laugh? Comparing Jokes Generated by Witscript and a Human Expert

Joe Toplyn & Ori Amir COLING 2025

# How to use AI to generate contextually integrated jokes

LLMs by themselves can't do it well.

- They only mimic surface patterns.
- Jokes often break expected patterns rather than mimic them.
- LLMs don't have use a good model of joke structure.



# How to use AI to generate contextually integrated jokes

Witscript is a neural-symbolic hybrid AI system.

- **Neural:** an LLM in the GPT family from OpenAI
- **Symbolic**: uses the joke-writing rules of a human expert

Witscript uses the LLM to execute the rules





### **HUM > MUN Regions**

(p < .01, corrected):



Amir & Biederman (2016)



#### WITSCRIPT RESPONDS:

By switching to a coffin with complimentary wifi.

# The Basic Joke-Writing Algorithm

- a) Get a topic sentence from the user.
  - What's a good way for Dracula to save money?
- b) Select two topic handles.
  - Dracula, save money
- c) Generate associations of the topic handles.
  - coffin, complimentary Wi-Fi
- d) Create a punch line that links associations unexpectedly.
  - a coffin with complimentary Wi-Fi
- e) Generate text to connect the topic and punch line.
  - By switching to a coffin with complimentary Wi-Fi

# The Experiment

- A professional writer for late-night comedy shows and Witscript each wrote jokes for the same set of news topics.
- The jokes were then split into two setlists to be performed in different live comedy shows.
- Each setlist had half of its jokes written by AI and half by the human. The two setlists were counterbalanced.

	Setlist 1	Setlist 2
Topic 1	Aljoke	Human joke
Topic 2	Human joke	Aljoke
Topic 3	Human joke	Al joke
Topic 4	Aljoke	Human joke
•••	•••	•••



### Human Joke



# Measuring Laughter of a Joke

- The laugh track was converted to **decibels** to mimic human sound perception.
- The area under the curve of Laughter over Time was computed, giving a measurement of **Total Laughter**.



### Comparing AI to Human: Single Show

- In a live comedy show with an audience of N = ~35, a comedian performed human and AI jokes in pseudo-random order.
- Jokes were ranked for funniness based on their Total Laughter (in decibel-seconds).
- The audience's reaction to the AI jokes was indistinguishable from the professional human writer's jokes.



### Comparing AI to Human: Two Shows

- Two shows with counterbalanced jokes by AI and Human were performed.
- **Total Laughter** had to be **normalized** to account for audience size and mood differences.
- **Median Laughter** in decibels (see graph) was identical for both shows and did not require normalization.
- No significant differences were detected between the AI and Human jokes for either measure.



## Conclusion

This study provides naturalistic, real-world evidence that when it comes to generating comedy/talk show monologuestyle humor, **an AI system can perform at the level of a professional human comedy writer**.

BUT... how valid are the results?



## **Standard of Proof**

Historically, the standard for demonstrating that AI had reached a certain milestone against human performance involved only a few data points.



In 2011, Watson (AI) competed **only once** against two human champions on *Jeopardy!*, and won.



Kasparov played only **six games** with Deep Blue (AI) in 1997, scoring **2.5-3.5**.

# **Strengths and Limitations**

### Naturalistic/Real-World Study

#### Strengths

• The dependent variable is genuine laughter.

 Higher external validity compared to most studies that employ ratings on a numerical scale.

#### Limitations

- Laughter can be affected by factors other than the joke (e.g., gestures, environment). But these factors should average out.
- Rating on a numerical scale can capture **aspects of amusement** that are not expressed in laughter, and laughter is affected by factors other than amusement.

### **Live Audience**

#### Strength

Captures feedback from a large number of participants (N = ~55 across shows)

#### Limitations

- Audience members are not independent; laughter is contagious.
- Some audience members laugh louder than others.

#### What does this all mean for comedy writing?



#### www.witscript.com